

# FINAL ASSESSMENT REPORT

**PERIODIC PROGRAM REVIEW (PPR)  
Bachelor of Arts  
In Public Administration and Governance  
Faculty of Arts**

In accordance with the Institutional Quality Assurance Process (IQAP), this final assessment report provides a synthesis of the external evaluation and the internal response and assessments of the undergraduate Public Administration and Governance (PAG) program. This report identifies the strengths of the program, together with opportunities for program improvements and enhancements, and it sets out and prioritizes the recommendations that have been selected for implementation.

This report also includes an Implementation Plan that identifies who will be responsible for approving the recommendations set out in the final assessment report; who will be responsible for providing any resources entailed by those recommendations; any changes in organization, policy, or governance that will be necessary to meet the recommendations, who will be responsible for leading those recommendations; and timelines for acting on and monitoring the implementation of those recommendations

## **SUMMARY OF THE PERIODIC PROGRAM REVIEW OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND GOVERNANCE PROGRAM**

Started in 1962, the Public Administration and Governance (PAG) Program offers the only part-time undergraduate degree in public administration in Ontario. Students can receive the following credentials upon successful completion of each level in the program:

- Level 1 Certificate in Public Administration and Governance
- Level 2 Certificate in Public Administration and Governance
- Level 3 Bachelor of Arts (Hons), Public Administration and Governance

The program contains a curriculum of forty courses offered at three levels. Levels 1 and 2 require eight courses each, and successful completion results in the awarding of a certificate, respectively. Level 3 comprises twenty-four courses and, upon completion, results in a Bachelor of Arts (Hons) degree. Level 3 has two tracks, students with significant public sector experience and with a CGPA of 2.67, may be eligible to enroll in the Practicum (PPA 50A/B), which reduces the number of courses required at this level to seventeen one-semester courses. To determine eligibility to enroll in the practicum, a student must complete a Work Experience Assessment Form, which the PAG Undergraduate Program Director reviews to determine eligibility for PPA 50A/B. Students not eligible for the Practicum option, complete twenty-four courses.

In 1999, Ryerson University (now known as Toronto Metropolitan University) signed a Partnership Agreement with the First Nations Technical Institute (FNTI), which provides an option, within the PAG Program, to offer public administration education to First Nations students, who work in administrative

and leadership roles in their communities throughout Ontario and beyond. Students take the same courses as non-Indigenous PAG students, with three exceptions: 1) Indigenous instructors are sought to teach all courses; 2) courses and assignments are created to support First Nations students and their communities, by building on, and recognizing their history and lived experiences; and 3) at the launch of the partnership, the Department of Politics and Public Administration received funding to create six new customized courses, which were developed in consultation with FNTI and the program's Advisory Board. These six courses are now delivered routinely and exclusively to FNTI students. Each course is delivered intensively, thus allowing students to participate and complete two, sometimes three courses per semester. Historically, courses were offered in many locations throughout southern and northern Ontario, as well as through video conference software. More recently, owing to student preferences and high expenses, courses are delivered at the FNTI campus in Tyendinaga, Ontario, on TMU's campus, and following the global pandemic that began in 2020, all virtually.

The PAG's program is designed to meet the diverse and specialized educational needs of people working in the public sector, the para-public sector, the not-for-profit, and voluntary sectors. Many students enroll in the PAG Program to gain valuable educational credentials, while working full-time. The PAG Program also includes many underrepresented students that may not have had the opportunity to attend a post-secondary educational institutions, when they graduated from high school, but they can now accept the opportunity to advance their educational goals

One of the main strengths of the program is its blend of theory and practice, as reflected in the curriculum, and the use of both academic faculty and public service practitioners in the classroom. Flexibility is a hallmark of this program as well, featuring three accredited academic exit points (Level 1 Certificate, Level 2 Certificate, and Level 3, Degree). Toronto Metropolitan University's Public Administration and Governance program provides its graduates with the knowledge, skills, and creativity required to succeed in the unique, complex, and dynamic environment within which Canadian public administration takes place. Managers, policy analysts, administrative officers, front-line service providers and support staff are among those who have benefited from the program.

On September 13<sup>th</sup> 2021, the undergraduate program in Public Administration and Governance submitted a Self-Study Report to the Vice-Provost Academic, which outlined program descriptions and learning outcomes, an analytical assessment of the program, program data including a student survey, along with standard University Planning data tables. Course outlines and CVs for full-time and part-time faculty members who teach in the PAG Program, were also included.

The Department of Politics and Public Administration submitted a list of potential Peer Review Team (PRT) candidates to the Office of the Dean of Arts, who then selected Dr. Ahmed Shafiqul Huque, Professor, Department of Political Science, McMaster University and Dr. Kathleen McNutt, Professor and Vice-President Research, University of Regina. The PRT visit was conducted virtually (Zoom) on October 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup>, 2021. The PRT was given access to the self-study documents and then conducted meetings with the Provost and Vice-President Academic; Vice-Provost Academic; Dean of Arts; Associate Dean of Arts, Undergraduate Programs; Department of Politics and Public Administration Chair; PAG Undergraduate Director, faculty, staff, students, and alumni from the Department of Politics and Public Administration and the First Nations Technical Institute (FNTI), as well as the Chief Librarian and Liaison

Librarian. The PRT submitted a report that summarized the key observations of its review of the PAG undergraduate program self-study to the Dean of Arts and the Vice Provost Academic on November 8<sup>th</sup>, 2021. The report was forwarded to the Department on November 9<sup>th</sup>, 2021.

In summary, the Department of Politics and Public Administration is pleased with the PRT's favorable review of the BA in Public Administration and Governance program. The PRT's observed that the PAG "...program succeeds in inculcating values and imparting skills among students that contribute to their personal and professional development and, eventually, to the needs of society" (p.3).

In addition, the PRT recognized the following strengths of the Department of Politics and Public Administration and the Public Administration and Governance Program.

- The Department of Politics and Public Administration is very committed to offering students a range of experiential learning opportunities.
- The PAG Program focuses on practical skills and the theoretical application of policy theory.
- The design of this part-time, laddered (PAG) program is unique in Canada.
- The PAG program structure is very appealing to public administration professionals seeking to advance in public, non-profit, or private careers.
- The program offers flexibility to learners through evening classes, online distance education, and hybrid delivery and offers opportunities for practicum options.
- Of particular note is the FNTI-PAG partnership, which delivers a specialized stream of PAG/FNTI education for Indigenous administrators.
- The curriculum reflects the current state of the discipline or area of study. This high flex program is both innovative and accessible.
- The reviewers commended both the design and modes of delivery of PAGP.

The PRT also recognized the following areas for enhancement within the Public Administration and Governance Program.

- Renew the Partnership Agreement between the First Nations Technical Institute and the Department of Politics and Public Administration.
- Greater attention to the needs of part-time students for after-hour academic support.
- Ensure the five-year course offering table remains current.
- Introduce governance concepts and theories earlier in the curriculum.
- Seek out new partnerships.
- Create a PAG Alumni Association.

In terms of the PPR process and PAG Self-Study, the PRT found:

- The mapping of UDLE's to learning goals to learning outcomes to be difficult to read and understand.
- The information provided by the University Planning Office, based on a standard 4–5-year undergraduate program, with an annual fall intake, does not adequately reflect the three intakes per year for the PAG Program.
- Inconsistencies with respect to the graduation and employment rates.

- Including old data from the 2001-2002 PPR was not helpful.
- The SWOT analysis from 2013 did not provide a clear picture.
- The long period of time covered in this PPR made getting an up to date read of graduation rates and employment rates difficult to ascertain.

The Department of Politics and Public Administration submitted its response to the PRT report to the Dean of the Faculty of Arts on January 14, 2021, The Dean provided a response to the Department on 14 September 2022.

The Public Administration and Governance Program values the important feedback it has received at each stage of its Periodic Program Review. As both the PRT and the Dean's Response noted, the PAG has a number of unique features that provide students with a three-tiered structure, and a strong commitment to experiential learning, and career focused outcomes. Going forward, the PAG will work closely with the Office of Curriculum Quality Assurance to ensure that the next PPR, which is slated to begin in 2024, will be produced in a timelier manner.

The Academic Standards Committee completed its assessment of the Public Administration and Governance program on December 9, 2022. The Committee indicated that a thorough, analytical and self-critical program review was conducted. The program integrated into the developmental plan feedback from students, alumni, the FNTI, and peer reviewers, and outlined a comprehensive plan for program enhancements moving forward.

The Academic Standards Committee recommends that the program continue, as well as provide a one-year follow-up report, as follows:

1. The mandated One-Year Follow-up Report be submitted by June 30, 2022 to include:
  - a. Updates on the status of the initiatives outlined in the Implementation Plan;
  - b. Updates on renewal efforts with the FNTI

Presented to Senate for Approval: **January 24, 2023**

Start date of next Periodic Program Review: **2025-26**

## **SUMMARY OF THE REVIEWERS' RECOMMENDATIONS WITH THE PROGRAM'S AND DEAN'S RESPONSES**

### **PRT Recommendation #1**

Create a joint task force to renew the MOU with FNTI. The twenty-three-year relationship with First Nations Technology Institute is stale and does not reflect an open and equitable partnership. As FNTI is now a degree-granting institution, the Department should proactively engage in a partnership renewal based on shared-decision making and co-management or risk losing the partnership. Interviews with First Nations

partners, graduates, and students revealed disconnects between partners. Participants describe the action of the Faculty and Department as performative – lofty aspirations and gestures with little substantive actions.

**Timeline: 1-2 years**

The Department is in agreement with these recommendations as is the Office of the Dean of Arts. The Department points out that this recommendation is in keeping with departmental Recommendations 5 and 8, both short term goals with a timeline of 1-2 years. A joint task force with representatives from the Department as academic home of the program, the Program Management Committee, the FNTI administration, Indigenous faculty, staff, students and alumni will be important to arrive at a renewed agreement that should suit the needs of all. Indigenous faculty in the Faculty of Arts have indicated their interest in being involved in the administration of the partnership. The Office of the Dean of Arts considers this collaboration essential for the Department to forge a new agreement with FNTI that would be the basis for a renewed MOU between the Faculty of Arts and FNTI.

**PRT Recommendation #2 The Department of Politics and Public Administration engage in a collegial planning process.**

The Department would benefit from a collegial process to map its future direction and develop a collective vision of priorities over the next decade. The reviewers believe there is

excellent value in the Department prioritizing how it will use its resources and expend its energy. Views on the values of the various aspects of the program are disparate. The pandemic has taught universities many lessons, and the time to take risks and challenge assumptions is now. The reviewers strongly encourage the Department to be aspirational and develop a plan open to change and potential growth.

**Timeline: none given**

The Office of the Dean of Arts recognizes the Department's dedication to its students, commitment to education fulfilling societal need and its promotion of experiential learning. While there are always competing demands for resources, we encourage the Department to continue to be aspirational in creating new initiatives. Proposals for hires, for innovation in learning and teaching will be considered when accompanied by a strong rationale. As the Office of the Dean of Arts strengthens academic supports available to faculty and students, our goals for the entire Faculty of Arts are based on developing "a plan open to change and potential growth".

### **PRT Recommendation #3 Create a departmental vision to advance Equity, Diversity, Inclusion and Decolonization (EDIC).**

Following the mandate of TMU's Office of the Vice-President, Equity and Community Inclusion (OVPECI) the University's commitment is "to maintain a visible presence for equity, diversity and inclusion (EDI) and Indigenous values and experience as integral components across all teaching, learning, research, service and administrative functions of the university, while addressing the range of systemic barriers at Ryerson." The Department would benefit significantly by developing a plan aligned with the above statement. Unfortunately, from faculty hiring diversity to lack of Indigenous content in the PAG program to attentiveness of the students' views of EDIC, the Departmental focus is nebulous.

#### **Timeline: None given**

The Office of the Dean of Arts agrees with the PRT on the importance of upholding and deepening the University's commitment "to maintain a visible presence for equity, diversity and inclusion (EDI) and Indigenous values and experience as integral components across all teaching, learning, research, service and administrative functions of the university, while addressing the range of systemic barriers at Ryerson." This is an aspiration for the Faculty of Arts as a whole. The longstanding partnership between the Department and the First Nations Technical Institute has its roots in the principles of EDID. However, from the perspective of FNTI members at this point in time, the partnership is not equal or satisfactory. A dialogue needs to be re-established. This will require greater collaboration with Indigenous faculty, staff, students and alumni. Greater diversity is needed in the Department's teaching complement and we recognize that the Department is working to repair this deficiency. It is important to have diverse perspectives in the classroom and in academic governance.

## **IMPLEMENTATION PLAN**

### **Section One: Review and Outreach**

**Recommendation One:** An in-depth review and renegotiation of the Partnership Agreement with the First Nations Technical Institute (FNTI).

**Rationale:** No comprehensive review of the FNTI partnership with the Department of Politics and Public Administration has been undertaken. There is a need to clarify roles of each partner and examine opportunities for improvement. While FNTI-PPA course content has changed over time to improve Indigenous content and relevance to students, course names have not changed since the partnership's inception.

**Implementation Plan:** Create a Task Force to renew the Partnership Agreement between FNTI and the Department of Politics and Public Administration.

**Responsibility for:**

A) Leading: The Department of Politics and Public Administration Chair and an FNTI Leader will Co-Chair the Task force with representatives from key stakeholder groups.

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, and Monitoring: The Department of Politics and Public Administration, the First Nations Technical Institute, the Office of the Dean of Arts, and the Provost's Office.

**Timeline:** Begin late Fall 2022 or early Winter 2023

**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one year after Senate approval of PAG PPR.

**Recommendation Two:** Develop an updated Public Administration and Governance (PAG) alumni list, which will be used to create a PAG alumni network.

**Rationale:** This recommendation will assist the PAG program to stay connected with graduates. We expect a revised list will lead to the creation of a PAG alumni network, which could help with future employment and placement options, support fund raising, and develop a stronger identity with the PAG Program.

**Implementation Plan:** Review and update the PAG Alumni list, with the goal of creating an online PAG Alumni network that can be sustained and revised over time.

**Responsible for:**

A) Leading: The PAG Program, with assistance from the Faculty of Arts Career Engagement Specialist, Program Advisory Council, and TMU Alumni Relations.

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, and Monitoring: The Public Administration and Governance (PAG) Program, the Department of Politics and Public Administration, and Alumni Relations.

**Timeline:** Begin Winter 2023

**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one year after Senate approval of PAG PPR.

**Recommendation Three:** Create and distribute an employer survey.

**Rationale:** The PAG Program has not undertaken a comprehensive survey of employers in decades. We recognize that it is important for future curriculum planning to be aware of upcoming employment trends in the public, non-profits, and private sectors, to better equip graduate for rewarding employment opportunities.

**Implementation Plan:** To create and distribute an employer survey

**Responsible for:**

A) Leading: The Public Administration and Governance Program

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, and Monitoring: The PAG Program will work with the Curriculum Development Consultant and the Department's Program Advisory Council.

**Timeline:** Begin Winter or Early Spring 2023

**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one year after Senate approval of PAG PPR.

**Recommendation Four:** Implement a Marketing and Outreach Strategy to Better Promote the PAG Program.

**Rationale:** The Department, the Chang School, and FNTI have done little marketing and promotion of the PAG program in a continued and sustained manner. Changes to the program, particularly online delivery, are attractive and should be promoted to increase student enrollment.

**Implementation Plan:** To create and implement a marketing and outreach strategy.

**Responsible for:**

A) Leading: The Public Administration and Governance Program

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, and Monitoring: The PAG Program will work with work with Chang School of Continuing Education and the Faculty of Arts Communication Coordinator

**Timeline:** Begin Spring 2023



**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one year after Senate approval of PAG PPR.

**Recommendation Five:** (from the PRT Report) The Department of Politics and Public Administration engage in a collegial planning process.

**Rationale:** (From PRT Report). The Department would benefit from a collegial process to map its future direction and develop a collective vision of priorities over the next decade. The reviewers believe there is excellent value in the Department prioritizing how it will use its resources and expend its energy. Views on the values of the various aspects of the program are disparate. The pandemic has taught universities many lessons, and the time to take risks and challenge assumptions is now. The reviewers strongly encourage the Department to be aspirational and develop a plan open to change and potential growth.

**Implementation Plan:** Hold a retreat for Department colleagues to engage in a collegial planning process.

**Responsibility for:**

A) Leading: The Department of Politics and Public Administration Chair

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, Monitoring: The Department of Politics and Public Administration, the Office of Dean of Arts, and the Office of the Vice-Provost Faculty Affairs

**Timeline:** Spring or Fall 2023

**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one year after Senate approval of PAG PPR.

**Recommendation Six:** (from the PRT Report). Create a Departmental vision to advance equity, diversity, inclusion, and decolonization (EDIC).

**Rationale:** (from the PRT Report). Following the mandate of TMU’s Office of the Vice-President, Equity and Community Inclusion (OVPECI), the University’s commitment is ‘to maintain a visible presence for equity, diversity, and inclusion (EDI) and Indigenous values and experiences as integral components across all teaching, learning, research, service, and administrative functions of the university, while addressing the range of systemic barriers at Ryerson. According to the PRT, the Department would benefit significantly by developing a plan aligned with the above statement.’

**Implementation Plan:** Organize a series of meetings to implement this recommendation.

**Responsibility for:**

A) Leading: The Department of Politics and Public Administration Chair

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, and Monitoring: The Department of Politics and Public Administration, with support from the Office of the Vice-President, Equity and Community Inclusion, and the Office of the Dean of Arts.

**Timeline:** Fall 2023 or Winter 2024

**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one year after Senate approval of PAG PPR.

**Section Two: Curriculum Revisions, Faculty Renewal, and Capacity Building**

**Recommendation Seven:** Review PAG program requirements to address curriculum gaps and increase student choice in course offerings and delivery.

**Rationale:** Suggestions from students, the PRT Report, and the Dean’s Office all point to opportunities to renew and consider revising the curriculum to fill gaps and increase student choice.

**Implementation Plan:** There is support from the Self Study PRT Report, and the Dean’s Response to remove PPA 51A/B Public Policy Research Paper, which will be replaced with two senior level Public Policy and Administration (PPA) courses. Review the PAG curriculum to seek more opportunities to increase student choice and more online delivery of courses.

**Responsible for:**

A) Leading: The Public Administration and Governance Program will complete the necessary calendar changes in spring/summer 2023, which will then be brought forward to be implemented for 2024- 2025.

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, and Monitoring: Guidance will be sought from the Associate Dean, Innovation in Learning and Teaching, the Manager, Academic Support and Curriculum Innovation, the First Nations Technical Institute, the Digital Media Projects Office, the Centre for Excellence in Learning and Teaching and the Digital Education Strategists at the Chang School.

**Timeline:** Begin Winter 2023

**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one year following Senate approval of PAG PPR.

**Recommendation Eight:** Recruit new full-time faculty members to support and strengthen the Public Administration and Governance (PAG) generally and specifically, the First Nations Technical Institute (FNTI) program option.

**Rationale:** A review of faculty to contract lecturer-teaching ratios showed that students are learning more than 50% and sometimes 80% of program content from contract lecturers.

**Implementation Plan:** To propose a plan to hire new full-time faculty members to strengthen and diversify the PAG Program and the FNTI/PAG Option.

**Responsible for:**

A) Leading: The Politics and Public Administration's Department Hiring Committee (DHC) will coordinate this initiative.

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, and Monitoring: The DHC, the Office of the Dean of Arts, the Office of the Vice-Provost Faculty Affairs

**Timeline:** Begin Fall 2023

**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one to two years, following Senate approval of PAG PPR.

**Recommendation Nine:** Consider ways to involve more RFA in the Public Administration and Governance Program delivery of courses.

**Rationale:** Quality indicators in the Self Study highlight the disproportionately high number of contract lecturers teaching in the program.

**Implementation Plan:** Encourage RFA colleagues to consider teaching in the PAG Program more frequently. Promote Faculty of Arts curriculum development grants as a way to enable faculty to create or update PPA courses. Of particular interest would be the development of more Indigenous courses for the FNTI/ PAG Program

**Responsible for:**

A) Leading: This initiative will be shared between the Public Administration and Governance Program and the Department Chair.

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, Monitoring: The PAG Program, the Department Chair, and the Office of the Dean of Arts.

**Timeline:** Spring or Summer 2024

**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one to two years, following Senate approval of PAG PPR.

**Recommendation Ten:** Consider international and executive training opportunities that could be offered by the Public Administration and Governance Program.

**Rationale:** With domestic enrolments stable but lower than past years, opportunities for potential revenue generation and increased enrolment may be found in international and/or executive learning opportunities.

**Implementation Plan:** Working with the Office of the Dean of Arts and TMU International, the PAG will look into opportunities to offer international or executive learning.

**Responsibility for:**

A) Leading: The Public Administration and Governance Program and the Department Chair

B) Approving Recommendation, Providing Resources, Monitoring: The PAG Program and the Department Chair, with support from TMU International, and the Office of the Dean of Arts.

**Timeline:** Fall 2024

**Follow Up:** Status report will occur one to two years, following Senate approval of PAG PPR.